

MEETING MINUTES
SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE & COMMUNITY MEETING
October 22, 2014 – Special Meeting
6:30 p.m. – South Gulf Cove HOA Pavilion

Attendees: Paul Chattinger, Patricia Hall, Karen Ireland, Jeanne Keyser, John Paine and Carmine Rossi

County: Mike Dallenbach, Linda Rohmer-Free, Chuck Koons, James Layport, Danny Quick, Judith Nothdurft, Joanne Vernon, and Sandy Wright

Guests: Sign in sheet attached

The meeting was called to order at 6:31 p.m. Mr. Paine thanked the Yacht Club and HOA for getting the word out about the meeting.

All Committee members were present and introduced. A quorum was present.

- Mr. Paine explained the purpose of a Municipal Service Benefit Unit (MSBU).

Proposed Paving Program

- Mr. Quick, the Director of Public Works, was introduced and he introduced the County staff in attendance. Mr. Quick explained the process of making recommendations to the Board of County Commissioners (BCC) for a paving program. He will make a recommendation that will include the minutes from this meeting and the results of the mail out survey that will be done. During November, there will be a regular South Gulf Cove (SGC) Street & Drainage (S&D) meeting where a recommendation for the paving program will be finalized.
- SGC Street & Drainage Advisory Committee Recommendation - Mr. Paine explained that a regular meeting was held October 16, 2014 where recommendations were brought forward. Since then, another option has been presented by Public Works. The Committee agreed on a two phase program. Originally the phases consisted of 1&1a, 2,3,4,5 that were done following the water and sewers construction. South Gulf Cove has a total of 147.2 miles of road and 9 bridges. The estimated annual assessment increase for the 2 Phase proposal to pave all roads in SGC is approximately \$200 per lot for 10 years. This amount is in addition to the current assessment. A Public Works recommendation is currently on the table for paving Phase 1 only (formerly Phase 1 & 1a).
- Mr. Rossi reported that the Committee has been discussing a paving program since 2012. He thanked all of the property owners for attending and stated that County staff is guiding the committee. This is a \$24 million dollar project. He explained the locations of phases 1&1a on the map, which includes approximately 46 miles of roads. They were paved in 1995 and will be 21 years old before new pavement is applied. The actual life of a road in south Florida is 20-25 years. Mr. Rossi reviewed the "Pavement Condition Curve" provided by Engineering. The Committee discussed the feasibility of paving all roads in 1 and 2 phases to save on mobilization costs, although some life of the pavement will be lost on some roads. Asphalt is currently at a low rate and so is the interest. Mr. Rossi would rather pave all roads for \$200 per lot for 10 years. Mr. Rossi also reviewed proposals developed by Mr. Paine. He thinks paving could be done in two phases doing 1, 1a and 2 in 2016 and 3, 4, 5 in 2025. The assessments for water and sewers will be paid off in 2025; phases 1&1a have already been paid off.
- County Recommendation - Mr. Quick introduced Mr. Koons to go through the details of the proposed Paving Program and stated that he recommends paving only the roads that need it. Mr. Koons' recommendation included paving the roads in Phase 1&1a. He stated the rest of the roads were resurfaced from 2003-2007, and suggested waiting until sometime around 2020 or 2025 to discuss paving those roads. It will be up to the Committee to bring any other options or viewpoints to the BCC. Mr. Koons explained why Phase 1&1a should be done now and further explained how roadways deteriorate over time. The Committee needs to start planning for repaving. The Engineering Department recommends only paving the roads that need to be done.

SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE & COMMUNITY MEETING
October 22, 2014 – Special Meeting
Page 2

Project Cost Estimate

- Loan Process & Assessment Rate Increase - Ms. Rohmer-Free received a call from the attorney's office stating the MSBUs are not allowed to bank funds to spend on future projects. She explained that a tax increase has been avoided over the past few years due to the downturn in the economy. Joining paving contracts with other areas has nothing to do with comingling funds; South Gulf Cove funds stay in South Gulf Cove and are not spent in other areas. The benefit of the paving is a benefit to the whole community and it does not have to be in front of everyone's house. In July there will be a public hearing with the BCC to discuss an annual assessment increase of \$60 per Equivalent Residential Unit (ERU) for 10 years. In March, the Finance Department will go to the BCC with the plan that has been brought to the property owners. Ms. Free explained the loan process including the 5% contingency cost, administrative fees for maintaining the loan, and tax collection fees associated with the loan. A commercial loan is taken out for 5 years then another loan is taken out 5 years later to possibly save on interest. If the funds build up and there is more than is needed to pay the loan, the loan will be prepaid early.
- Mr. Chattinger stated that there are a lot of numbers and proposals. This committee is looking for the best deal for the community. Paving has to happen sooner or later; we can pay now and enjoy the roads or put it off and pay inflated amounts later. He asked for the property owners to keep this in mind.
- Mr. Rossi discussed the Engineering paving projections from 2013 to 2020. He explained that he took the \$24,320 million projected for 5 phases and calculated the cost for 2 phases and it saves over \$5 million dollars.
- The County recommends paving Phase 1 only (phase 1&1a) in 2016.

Citizen Input on Agenda Items Only (3 Minute Limit)

- Question: How thick will the asphalt be that is put down during the re-paving?
Answer: Typically 1 ½ - 1 ¾ inches of asphalt are applied. The roads will be assessed to make an evaluation prior to the actual paving.
- Question: Who paid for paving the roads that were paved in 2003-2007?
Answer: The MSBU paid for the paving. There were some funds that were given to the MSBU from General Development Corp.
- Question: Are there any legal rights for charging a usage fee for large trucks to use their streets? If a contractor wants to build a building on his street he should be liable for the roads.
Answer: Ms. Free explained that loans are obtained through the County Clerk of the Circuit Court and stated that historically bonds are not used. Gas taxes collected are used on the roads that are not maintained by MSBUs and also funds bridge repairs on those roads.
- Comment: The roads are supposed to last 20-25 years; he can't understand why they should be re-paved before that. Charlotte County is one of the highest taxed County's in Florida. He doesn't feel any additional roads should be paved now and doesn't feel the cost of asphalt will go up. He would like the Committee to look at only paving what needs to be done.
- Question: What kind of process will be used to re-pave? Will the roads be milled? How will driveway pavers be handled?
Answer: The County doesn't typically mill a road unless it is required. The paving contractor is required to pave 12 inches into the driveway for each 1 inch of asphalt thickness that is laid.
- Comment: He thinks this is good and doesn't mind doing it sooner than later to save money. The road was in terrible shape and was repaved 2006 or 2008; within two years after he built his house the road looked as bad as it did before he built. He was told it was because the road is not used and someone else said it's the road base. He doesn't want to put a band aid fix on a \$24 million project; he doesn't mind paying but wants it to be done right.
Public Works: All the roads in South Gulf Cove were paved with a soil cement base; a crack in the base doesn't mean the road is failing. The only way to remove a crack in the road would be to remove the entire base which would be cost prohibitive. Driving on a roadway kneads the asphalt which keeps it flexible.

SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE & COMMUNITY MEETING
October 22, 2014 – Special Meeting
Page 3

If a road is not used; it sits and bakes in the sun day after day. The asphalt becomes brittle, potholes form and base repairs are then required. When overlay is applied to a cracking road; the crack will reflect through the overlay within 2-3 years; that doesn't mean the road is failing.

- Comment: Mr. Rossi commented on saving \$5 million but he feels if we start repaving every 15 years they won't be saving anything.
- Question: The community is only 11% built out; was that factored in and will future construction be detrimental to the roads?

Answer: The weight of heavy equipment doesn't damage the road that much; it is more the negligence by some contractors. The sun baked roads making the roads brittle has a greater negative impact on the roads.

- Question: Is the County making their recommendation because it's easy to manage instead of being based on the need?

Answer: Only the roads in 1 & 1a are being recommended for paving; they are the ones that are in need.

- Question: They just built their house and they have pavers for their driveway. She is concerned about covering her pavers and who will bare that cost?

Answer: The County tries to accommodate as much as possible. If the property owner wants to remove the first row of pavers, the county tries to work with them and the contractor is directed not pave onto the driveway. Technically the driveway is partially in the County right-of-way and driveway permits explain that.

- Comment: Mobilization fees were explained and he is all for paving all of South Gulf Cove at one time. The assessment is \$16 per month for 10 years; he would rather have everybody get their streets paved.

- Question: Do the roads in phase 1&1a already have sewer and water installed?

Answer: Sewer and Water lines have been installed to all of the lots in South Gulf Cove.

- Question: Can the cost go down between now and the time the project goes to the BCC for approval?

Answer: The cost is an estimate only. Most loans are paid off early.

Comment and Question: He thanked County staff for attending and discussing ways to save money. He likes the idea of phase 1 to include the roads in 1&1a and asked when phase 2 and 3 would kick in? He brought up the subject of combining work with other MSBUs. Would combining paving with other areas paving be beneficial for the MSBU?

Answer: The asphalt tonnage paid for by one MSBU is installed in that MSBU. Funds collected by one MSBU are never spent in a different MSBU.

- Question: What is the relevance of the attorney's comments about not being able to pay ahead?

Answer: It means that money can't be collected this year to pave in 3-4 years. If money is being collected it needs to be in the work program.

- Question: Would the 1½ -1 ¾ inch topping also be applied at the major intersections where there is heavy equipment coming in and out?

Answer: Each roadway will be inspected and roadways that have irregularities will be dealt with individually. If slippage occurs, the road will have to be milled and corrected.

- Question: Are the MSBU funds that are set aside for South Gulf Cove S&D Unit kept separate, does that money earn interest, and what is the balance of that account?

- Answer: Yes the funds collect interest: Ms. Free doesn't have the balance available at this meeting. Ms. Free explained that the county pools the money together and it is invested. Ms. Free will follow up regarding the balance.

- Question: Can the speed limits be changed during this project?

Answer: Mr. Quick explained that Florida statute addresses the speed limits. He asked Mr. Crawford to express his concerns with the Committee chairman so they can be brought to the Transportation Engineer for follow up.

SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE & COMMUNITY MEETING
October 22, 2014 – Special Meeting
Page 4

- Question: If the roads are not all paved now and are done in phases, wouldn't they continue to be done in phases 20 years from now?
Answer: The roads paved in 2016 will need to be repaved in 20-25 years. Phase 1&1a need to have something done in the very near future and due to the budgeting process the Committee needs to decide which recommendation they are going to make to the BCC. The Committee has already made a motion to go with the 2 phase program; however that may change based on the property owners input.
- Comment: He appreciates the facts that were presented here tonight. He is comfortable with doing the first phase 1&1a and has no issue with that; however as far as doing 3, 4 & 5 he doesn't feel the need to do these roads if the paving is not yet needed. He would rather wait and see on the other roads until the paving is needed. He said if they are not broken there is no need to fix them.
- Question: Why isn't the county participating in this project like a partnership as they did with ball parks, Murdock Village and the boat races?
Answer: Roads are left up to the MSBUs to fund. MSBUs make a lot of sense in an area that has so many undeveloped lots.
- Comment: The committee should consider phasing to be set in the areas that are needed most. He has streets in his area where weeds are growing up through the pavement. His house is the only one on his street and it is terrible. It was paved in 2005.
Answer: Herbicide treatments have been applied in different areas. Mr. Koons stated that the herbicide program has been successful and will most likely continue.
- Comment: South Gulf Cove has some of the best drainage in the whole county. All the pipe replacement has caused a ripple effect when driving over the roads; he was told it would be overlaid.
- Comment: He likes the idea of not fixing roads that aren't broke. He has walked, biked or run on all the roads in South Gulf Cove and thinks the committee needs to come up with a plan to fix the ones that are broken. He stated that all the roads in South Gulf Cove are unsafe because there are no sidewalks.

Mr. Paine explained that there is a regular meeting scheduled for November 6, 2014 at 2:00 p.m. where they will discuss which recommendation should be taken to the BCC for approval.

The meeting adjourned at 8:36 p.m.

Submitted by:



Sandy Wright
Public Works Department

CHARLOTTE COUNTY
PUBLIC WORKS DIVISION
SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE
ATTENDANCE ROSTER

MEETING DATE: Wednesday, October 22, 2014

MEETING TIME: 6:30 P.M. – South Gulf Cove Pavilion

**INFORMATION SUPPLIED ON THIS FORM BECOMES
PUBLIC RECORD**

NAME (please print)	Email Address	Telephone Number
THOMAS CERRETO		941-697-7791
Richard E. Parrott		571-970-7348
Bill Mahalak	wjmahalak@gmail.com	941-697-4771
Ken + Ginger Reile	ginger_sdi@yahoo.com	701-306-0023
Connie Mahalak	wjmahalak@gmail.com	941-697-4771
Julsrbanfeldmann	julsb.feldmann@gmail.com	(701) 720-3695
William + Henrietta GARRISON	^{underscore} henri_g2@msn.com	610-762-3748
John McAniff	John@MCANIFF.NET	941-698-0418
Candace Anderson	cropinsurancet@gmail.com	
H. Wells French	Wellshelm@aol.com	941-697-1870
DON Frye	donfrye@earthlink.net	941-828-0454
Becky Frye	-	941-828-0454
Atch John Kraigenow	JK1949@gmail.com	203 808 9125
PETER ANTONI	PETER@ANTONI.NET	847 527 7832
Jim Atkinson	jilinatkinson@earthlink.net	941-697-2026
Linda Atkinson	" "	" "
Karen Nielsen	denielsen@juno.com	732-616-9016
Elizabeth Hansen		698-1255
FRANK HANSEN	FRANKH492@AOL.COM	698-1255
Jack Crawford		252-207-7003

CHARLOTTE COUNTY
PUBLIC WORKS DIVISION
SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE
ATTENDANCE ROSTER

MEETING DATE: Wednesday, October 22, 2014

MEETING TIME: 6:30 P.M. – South Gulf Cove Pavilion

**INFORMATION SUPPLIED ON THIS FORM BECOMES
PUBLIC RECORD**

NAME (please print)	Email Address	Telephone Number
Richard Murgia	murgia@embarrmail.com	
Paul J Sabin	pjsmls382@yahoo.com	941-828-0155
Tom & Lisa merck	&	941-828-0144
Phil Hutchins	hutchipm@aol.com	941-697-2005
Cheryl, Cliff Limpert	CLimpert07@gmail.com	941-698-1881
Ron & Gerry Wozniak		
Charles Rhoades	leoser@hotmaill.com	
Glen Dreyer	C6Dreyer@yahoo.com	603-344-5681
Danwell Wilson	10525 Washington Rd	941-697-3335
Steve & Lillian Gann	9498 Modesto Circle	941-828-3626
Dan & Pauline Kendall	9470 Rosebud Circle	828-0326
Lynn & Barry Lawrence	llynzlaw@embarrmail.com	698-1066
Ewen Ketner	Ketners@yahoo.com	941-697-8598
Neal & Andy Gettle	cegettle@yahoo.com	941-697-4716
LARRY & MELODY MCKAY	l-w-mckay@hotmail.com	941-698-4161
Judie Klick		941-828-3656
Maria Yaulm-Torres		860-250-4347
John Robinson	Kathyrobby@embarrmail.com	941-697-6496
JENNIFER STEVENS		697-8766
RICHARD ROBERT	DLROBERT7@OUTLOOK.COM	

CHARLOTTE COUNTY
PUBLIC WORKS DIVISION
SOUTH GULF COVE NON-URBAN S&D ADVISORY COMMITTEE
ATTENDANCE ROSTER

MEETING DATE: Wednesday, October 22, 2014

MEETING TIME: 6:30 P.M. – South Gulf Cove Pavilion

**INFORMATION SUPPLIED ON THIS FORM BECOMES
PUBLIC RECORD**

NAME (please print)	Email Address	Telephone Number
Judy Nothdurft, MS DR	Judith.Nothdurft@charlottefl.com	575-3656
Sandy Wright, Admin	Sandra.Wright@charlottefl.com	575-3692
Carmine Rossi	carmandjudy@gmail.com	697-5310
PAUL CHATTINGER	THECHATTINGERS@EMBARQMAIL	697-8112
KAREN IRELAND	Kareneireland@gmail.com	698-1909
Jack Paine	painej@aembarqmail.com	830-1727
Bob & Anna DRATCH	robertdratch@gmail.com	697-4128
Roger & JoAnn Henderson	hopsandheifers@yahoo.com	759-3458
Robert Curto	CRICKET-DAKOTA@YAHOO.COM	697-6542
Joseph Linder	jilinder05@yahoo.com	561-512-9900
Jill Powers	japowers2013@gmail.com	201-572-4876
Steve POWARD	blogsteve6@gmail.com	941-662-5627
RICHARD D HALL	DAVEOLNGUY@EMBARQMAIL.COM	941-697-1178
DAVID WARNOCK	d.warnock@live.com	941-626-6049
CYNTHIA SHIVICK	shivc13505@gmail.com	774-212-2023
PATRICIA OTTOLINI	OTTO13505@GMAIL.COM	774-722-7412
Dennis Lis	dmlis1340@centurylink.net	610-207-6543
Barbara Winters	bldevenuto@EMBARQMAIL.COM	941-697-4861
Al & Cheryl Herman	queennmathermnd@aol.com	941-697-0823
DONNA & VERNON MUSTOE	DMAVSTOE@aol.com	941-828-0351

Name	E Mail	Telephone
PAT HALL	halldp@cmbrugmail	(941) 697-1178
Jeanne Keyser	jeanneWASH72@cmbrugmail	941-286-7860